Final Learning Exercise Summary Report

Kaduna (Nigeria), Action Plan 2021-2023
Prof. Hauwa'u Evelyn Yusuf, Kaduna State University

Section 1. Local Context

In 2018, Kaduna joined Open Government Partnership to promote transparency, accountability and citizen participation in Governance. The State has co-created two action plans 2018-2020 and 2021 to 2023. This initiative has been largely successful given the fact that the Executive Governor served as the champion of the initiative. Kaduna is made of 23 Local Government Areas and 255 Political Wards. The State has three (3) arms of Government namely, Executive, Legislative and Judiciary.

The Executive Governor had the vision to govern the people in an inclusive and participatory manner and that largely accounted for the level of success of the initiative. The putting people first mantra of the administration aligned with the principles of Open Government Partnership, so it was largely easy to manage the partnership. The Kaduna State Government, to further demonstrate this commitment to OGP, signed the Mutual Accountability Framework (KMAF) with UK Foreign, Commonwealth Development Office to effectively coordinate service delivery at the sectoral level.

The Kaduna state Government as part of the co-creation of the Action Plan and the implementation worked with citizens by ensuring spaces were available to engage and get feedback. This was evident when citizens produced the zero draft of the Action Plan and participated in the validation of the Action Plan. The State also maintained the structure of the State Steering Committee and Technical Working Groups as Multi Stakeholder Groups for

the implementation of the State Action Plan. The various Accountability Mechanisms such as Kaduna Basic Education Accountability Mechanism (KADBEAM), Kaduna Maternal Accountability Mechanism (KADMAM), Kaduna Social Protection Accountability Coalition (KADSPAC), Local Government Accountability Mechanism (LGAM), Civil Society-Legislature Engagement and Accountability Platform (CLEAP), Tax Justice Network, Joint National Association of Persons with Disabilities (JONAPWD) played crucial roles in the implementation of the action plan by taking up initiatives and responsibility in collaboration with the OGP secretariat and led MDAs in each commitment area.

While Kaduna State Government had a dedicated budget line for managing OGP funding, the approval for the funding was not timely. However, development partners such as Partnership to Engage Reform and Learn supported both civil society and government to promote the principles of open governance. Save the Children International also supported the State in raising awareness and tracking of social protection interventions in the State amongst many others. The civil society members on the State Steering Committee also provided valuable insight as subject matter experts in managing the challenge of inadequate participation around the action plan implementation.

The key lessons from the Action Plan implementation is that Technology serves as an enabler to more participation in the budget process, disclosure of information (procurement data) improve understanding of government processes and build trust. Finally, the dialogue approach to engagement promotes shared understanding to achieve common goals in the OGP space.

Section 2. Action Plan Co-creation Process

Co-creation process review

The co-creation of the State Action Plan is coordinated by the OGP Kaduna Secretariat with strong collaboration of the State Steering Committee and our development partners. The state has a democratically elected steering committee made of equal representation between the state and non-state actors. The committee is saddled with the responsibility of providing overall leadership and strategy to the OGP.

During the co-creation phase of the Action Plan, spaces were created for citizens and government to make input from ideation, draft and validation and adoption of the action plan. Furthermore, citizens had the opportunity to propose the commitments areas in the State Action Plan to be implemented by the State Government.

The political will during the co-creation process of the Action Plan was evident in the expansion of the education service delivery area to include the health sector by the State Executive Council chaired by His Excellency the Governor of Kaduna State.

During the development of the action plan, there was a mixed category of stakeholders that proposed the commitment areas and milestones drawn from the government, civil society, private sector, persons with disability, academia and media.

Technology was utilized to ensure that the Action Plan was available for a much longer period and hosted on a drive for citizens to contribute to the State Action Plan. It was shared on various WhatsApp platforms for inputs.

Despite creating spaces for co-creation of the State Action Plan, we had the challenge of not being able to reach more citizens to contribute to the State Action Plan particularly at the local level. This was due to limited funding on the part of the government and our development partners.

Inadequate capacity on the OGP co-creation process hindered robust engagement by both Government officials and citizens. This includes gaps around utilizing the State Development Plan to achieve policy budget linkage and how it can be integrated into the OGP State Action Plan.

Co-creation process recommendations

a) Stronger collaboration and opportunity between the Technical Working Group and Accountability Mechanisms under social protection commitment and improving service delivery commitment to design and adopt the milestones for ownership and sustainability.
b) Develop capacity building sessions for government officials and citizens to leverage and expand knowledge about OGP.
c) Expand the scope of funding through stronger partnerships.

Section 3. Action Plan Commitments

Commitments implementation review

The implementation of the Action Plan was substantially completed. Based on the status of implementation of each milestone of Open Budget, we had 12 milestones under this commitment out of which six were completed, three were in progress, and three were not started at the end of the Action Plan. Some of factors that impacted positively during the implementation of the commitment is the effective leadership provided by the Planning and Budget Commission whose mandate is to ensure that the budget is open for citizens to engage at all levels. The Civil society Technical Working Group was strategic in engaging the government in terms of providing ideas for the government to adopt to make the budget more transparent due to improved capacity. This has resulted in the institutionalization of the Community Development Charter (CDC) and the development of a citizens' demand portal for collation of needs into the budget. Notable challenges include poor timing which made it difficult to use the disaggregated CDC to engage and inform the budget at the MDAs level

but that was addressed by an approval to include the CDC as part of the annual budget calendar. Also, in the absence of clear specification of inputs from CDC in the Budget, the Executive Council has approved the use of the CDC and the setting aside of 5% of capital component of the budget for the CDC needs to inform the budget. The results that the milestones achieved were in accordance with what was planned and in practice, the CDC has been institutionalized in the State as it is part of the Budget Calendar with a timeframe to collate the needs of citizens as part of Budget preparation process in the state.

Under the Open Contracting Commitment, based on the status of implementation of each milestone of open contracting, we had 10 milestones under this commitment out of which 8 were completed, one incomplete and one in progress at the end of the Action Plan.

The successful implementation of the milestones was largely due to the commitment of the institutional Agency- Kaduna State Public Procurement Authority (KADPPA) responsible for open contracting in the State and the commitment of the civil society (Including media and academia) in the TWG to strategically engage and provide unprecedented support to the government agencies in technical and financial resources for the agency to deliver on the milestones as captured under the commitment area.

The transformative degree of result showed that the disclosure of procurement information significantly improved. This can be seen by the procurement information published on the Open Contracting Data Standard (OCDS) Portal, Bills of quantity published and the interactive e-procurement portal. These have benefitted citizens in getting procurement information for tracking procurement across critical sectors in the state to ensure services are delivered to the ordinary citizens in the state. Access to procurement information granted citizens more ability to track the delivery of public goods in the state. Through the development of procurement tracking tools by civil society across priority sectors of education and health sectors, procurement information supports the triangulation of data with MDAs implementing projects. This has successfully been used to generate findings, develop scorecards that are used for high-level advocacy to influence government decisions by holding the government accountable. Notable users of this data are the accountability mechanisms in education, health sectors and local government. All the commitment milestones were implemented as planned and other related reforms were further implemented to support the ownership and sustainability of reform.

Under Citizens Engagement and based on the status of implementation of each milestone of citizens engagement, we had 3 milestones under this commitment out of which 1 was completed, two in progress at the end of the Action Plan. Some of the factors that hindered the completion of the milestones of the commitment is unavailability of funding. The major component of this commitment focused on restructuring the citizens feedback app, the decentralization of the Eyes and Ears Project to LGAs and MDAs in the state from the Planning and Budget Commission and holding town hall meetings. While we got approvals for the Executive Governor to implement this project, funding availability became a

challenge. As part of efforts to ensure that the tools are upgraded to provide feedback to citizens most especially the Citizens Feedback App, we engaged the service of PwC. The idea is to integrate the backend of the Eyes and Ears database with that of the Public Procurement Agency in the state for citizens to have real time updates on contracts that have been awarded. This was in progress at the end of the Action Plan. However, all the commitment milestones were implemented as planned.

Under the Strengthening Social Protection System, the overall level of completion of commitment was substantial. Based on the status of implementation of each milestone of social protection, we had 6 milestones under this commitment out of which three were completed, two were in progress and one incomplete. The implementation of this commitment had support from donor partner Save the Children International and a high-level interest from the State Government. This necessitated close monitoring of implementation of all the milestones with support from donor partners. The milestone had support from the Federal Government as well with required funding provided but not sufficient to implement all the milestones in the commitment area. The commitment provided an opportunity for citizens through the Kaduna Social Protection Accountability Coalition (KADSPAC) to track the beneficiaries of various social protection interventions in the state. The citizens had the opportunity to engage the Kaduna Social Investment Office on the State Social Register (SSR), a register made up of poor and vulnerable households in the state. Basic Health Care Provision funds were also tracked by citizens across the state. KADSPAC also carried out activities around tracking the budget performance of social protection across the State. All milestones were implemented as planned.

Under service delivery in education and health, had substantial levels of completion. Based on the status of implementation of each milestone of improving service delivery, we had eleven milestones under this commitment out of which nine were completed, two were in progress and one had not started at the time of compiling this assessment. The commitment area happens to be priority sectors of the State Government with high-level interest. In addition, the Kaduna Basic Education Accountability Mechanism (KADBEAM) and Kaduna Maternal Accountability Mechanism (KADMAM) have strong presence in the sector. The Accountability mechanisms developed scorecards and used for advocacy to influence decisions of government in both sectors. The milestones in the commitment area improved access to procurement information to citizens that enabled Accountability mechanisms functionality and use of evidence for advocacy. The Open Kaduna Forum, Maternal, Newborn and Child Health MNCH) Week, Quarterly review meeting with KADMAM and other key stakeholders on the Kaduna State Contributory Health Scheme, and Town hall meeting were channels for citizens and Government to engage. Given the broad nature of both sectors, there was an inability to quickly document evidence due to the broad nature of the sector and unavailability of key Government officials in some stakeholder engagements slowed smooth implementation of the commitment area.

3.2 Commitments recommendations

Technology served as a key enabler to the implementation of the open budget commitment through the automation of the CDC process in the state.

Open Budget Technical Working Groups strategic engagement with the leadership of the Commission and the implementation of some milestones by civil society organizations accounted for significant success of the open budget commitment. The commitment should be rolled over to the next State Action Plan (SAP III). The budget serves as a major policy used by the state to deliver better services to the citizens, and there is a need to sustain participation around it to ensure the government is held accountable by re-designing the milestones to help achieve a more participatory approach to budgeting.

This Open Contracting Commitment should be rolled over to SAP III and should include the Open Contracting for Infrastructure Data Standard (OC4IDS). This is because we intend to expand public disclosure of projects by joining the CoST Infrastructure Transparency Initiative.

The citizens engagement commitment should be rolled over to the third State Action Plan and expanded to include the desire to get the freedom of information bill domesticated in Kaduna State. The desire is to see the state being opened for access to information that will improve citizens' engagement.

This commitment of strengthening social protection is the priority of the government considering the data of multi-dimensional poverty in Kaduna State and the need to lift the ordinary citizens of the state out of poverty. There is the need to push for the signing of the Social Security Bill and advocate for the implementation of the provisions therein.

Improving service delivery in the education and health sector should be rolled over to SAP III as quality service delivery is critical to improvement in the quality of life in general. This buttresses the need to roll over this commitment to the third State Action Plan.

General
a) There is a need to raise awareness on the CDC process at the grassroots to enhance wider stakeholders' buy-in, participation and ownership for sustainability.
b) Tagging of CDC projects in the Budget should be adopted.
c) The various platforms through which the government provides updates on its policies and programs to citizens should be sustained. This includes radio engagement, town hall meetings, public policy dialogue etc.
d) The budget draft should be made available to citizens in good time for them to be able to make reasonable input into the draft.

e) Commitment area of "improving service delivery" should be unbundled for easy implementation of commitment.
f) Government to prioritize spending on programmes that impact the lives of citizens.